

BOURNEMOUTH, CHRISTCHURCH AND POOLE COUNCIL
COUNCIL

Minutes of the Meeting held on 17 December 2019 at 7.00 pm

Present:-

Cllr D A Flagg – Chairman

Cllr G Farquhar – Vice-Chairman

Present: Cllr H Allen, Cllr L Allison, Cllr M Anderson, Cllr S C Anderson, Cllr M Andrews, Cllr J Bagwell, Cllr S Baron, Cllr S Bartlett, Cllr J Beesley, Cllr D Borthwick, Cllr P Broadhead, Cllr M F Brooke, Cllr N Brooks, Cllr D Brown, Cllr S Bull, Cllr C R Bungey, Cllr R Burton, Cllr D Butler, Cllr D Butt, Cllr J J Butt, Cllr E Coope, Cllr M Cox, Cllr M Davies, Cllr N Decent, Cllr L Dedman, Cllr B Dion, Cllr B Dove, Cllr B Dunlop, Cllr M Earl, Cllr J Edwards, Cllr L-J Evans, Cllr D Farr, Cllr L Fear, Cllr N C Geary, Cllr M Greene, Cllr N Greene, Cllr A Hadley, Cllr M Haines, Cllr P R A Hall, Cllr N Hedges, Cllr P Hilliard, Cllr M Howell, Cllr M Iyengar, Cllr C Johnson, Cllr T Johnson, Cllr A Jones, Cllr J Kelly, Cllr D Kelsey, Cllr R Lawton, Cllr M Le Poidevin, Cllr L Lewis, Cllr R Maidment, Cllr S McCormack, Cllr D Mellor, Cllr P Miles, Cllr S Moore, Cllr L Northover, Cllr T O'Neill, Cllr P Parrish, Cllr S Phillips, Cllr M Phipps, Cllr K Rampton, Cllr Dr F Rice, Cllr C Rigby, Cllr R Rocca, Cllr M Robson, Cllr V Slade, Cllr A M Stribley, Cllr T Trent and Cllr K Wilson

42. Apologies

Apologies were received from Councillors A Filer, C Matthews, M White and L Williams.

43. Declarations of Interests

There were no declarations of interest made on this occasion.

44. Confirmation of Minutes

The Minutes of the Council meeting held on 5 November 2019 were confirmed as a correct record and signed.

45. Chairman's Announcements and Introduction

Death of Former Councillor

The Chairman referred with regret to the recent death of former Borough of Poole Councillor David Gillard. The Chairman called on Councillor Judy Butt who paid tribute to David Gillard. Councillors stood in silent tribute.

46. Public Issues

The Chairman advised that 3 public questions and 2 statements have been submitted for the meeting.

Public Question from Philip Stanley-Watts

At the time of this year's air festival trees were promised but nothing has happened yet. So when is the BCP area going to get these trees - they should be planted in particular areas to enhance the environment, and also to address the problem of flooding. In relation to natural defences, introducing beavers and water voles with soakaways along river banks in the BCP area?

Response by Councillor Lewis Allison (Portfolio Holder for Tourism, Leisure and Communities)

Work has been going on continuously since the Air Festival to identify the most suitable sites for the 240 trees which will offset the emissions from the air displays. Working with the Arboreal team, Tourism has been liaising with schools across the BCP area and are in the process of finalising agreements with those that will be receiving trees. The balance of the trees will be accommodated by the Countryside team, either at Hicks Farm or other nature reserve sites across the area and planted by the end of March 2020.

Public Question from Dr Martin Price on behalf of East Dorset Friends of the Earth

According to the UNEP Executive Director, Inger Andersen, "we now must deliver deep cuts to emissions - over 7% each year", (26/11/19). This means Zero Net Carbon (ZNC) by 2034 at the latest. "If we don't do this, the 1.5C goal will be out of reach before 2030," she added.

Therefore, the BCP target of ZNC by 2050 is not a sufficient response to the Climate Emergency. Will the Council now set specific policy targets – such as those already proposed to it by Friends of the Earth - to enable all businesses and households to achieve ZNC by 2030?

Response by Councillor Felicity Rice (Portfolio Holder for Environment and Climate Change)

Thank you Dr Price. We are very grateful to Friends of the Earth for attending the Council's recent Climate Emergency Senior Managers' Network meeting to present their recommendations, and also for the comments submitted. The Friends of the Earth publication 'Your Climate Action Plan' has been used as the reference for many of the options for action in the draft document being considered today. This Council is aware of the urgency for action and is committed in the Climate & Ecological Emergency Declaration to work with partners, businesses and the wider community to set a target date for making the region carbon neutral.

Following approval by Council today, a Place Leadership Board will be established which will then set a target date and make recommendations to achieve the target.

Public Question from Dr Ruth Arnold (the question was read out by Dr Rebecca Smith)

I am a GP living in Poole and am representing Medact Dorset. BCP council is investing £141 million in the fossil fuel industry, via the Dorset County Pension Fund. I am aware that you are not able to speak on behalf of Dorset Council but want to ask if BCP Council will support fossil fuel divestment?

You have declared a climate emergency and we want to see serious commitment to this. Many councils have passed motions calling on their relevant pension funds to divest fossil fuels. Will BCP Council formally call on the Dorset County Pension Fund to divest fossil fuels?

Response by Councillor Felicity Rice (Portfolio Holder for Environment and Climate Change)

Thank you Dr Arnold.

The Paris Climate Agreement aims to limit warming to well below 2°C and pursue efforts to limit it to 1.5°C. The recent Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) SR15 report emphasised the need to limit warming to the more ambitious 1.5°C target; we now know that 2°C of warming comes with unacceptable dangers to humanity (5). However, the fossil fuel industry has about 5 times more fossil fuels in its proven reserves than can be used if global warming is to be limited to even just 2°C (6). Despite this, it continues to explore for *even more* fossil fuels, and this is currently facilitated by investment from pension funds throughout the world.

“Lack of action on climate change threatens to make the world our children inherit a completely different world than we are living in today. Climate change is one of the single biggest challenges facing development, and we need to assume the moral responsibility to take action on behalf of future generations, especially the poorest”

Jim Yong Kim

World Bank President, back in 2012

With this in mind, it is worth noting that The Dorset Pension Scheme is currently worth around £3 billion and our 4000 officers that work for BCP, along with all the existing pensioners, will be interested to hear that a significant proportion, around 5%, of their pension fund is invested in fossil fuels. It is also helpful to note, that in surveys of pension funds, around 70% of members feel that their pension fund should not be investing in fossil fuels.

Since the membership of the Dorset Pension Fund changed in June 2019, divestment and climate change has been pushed up the agenda significantly by myself and Cllr David Brown from BCP.

Going out to consult with members of the pension scheme, and looking at the responsibilities of the Dorset Pension Fund with regards to our climate action steps going forwards is also part of the draft climate action plan that is on the agenda this evening.

The Dorset Pension Fund will be publishing an Investment Strategy Statement in 2020 which will clearly be an opportunity to guide investment so that the Dorset Pension Fund is protecting our planet and the future wellbeing of the people within the scheme, at the same time as creating investment.

Public Statement from Melissa Carrington on behalf of Extinction Rebellion Bournemouth, Christchurch and Poole on the response to the Climate and Ecological Emergency referred to at item 9 on the agenda.

Councillors, in July we asked you to give the Climate and Ecological Emergency your highest priority and allocate budgets and resources accordingly. I'm afraid that this action plan shows that our words were ignored. Pro-rata, based on other councils responses, this emergency needs a team of at least 8 dedicated council officers and a revenue budget of at least £750,000 a year in addition to very considerable capital spending. You cannot manage this on a shoe string, getting well qualified staff in place to deliver this must be your utmost priority. You've expressed an ambition now show some true leadership.

Public Statement from Michael Hancock on the response to the Climate and Ecological Emergency referred to at item 9 on the agenda (Mr Hancock was not in attendance and the Chief Executive read out the statement)

I very much applaud the draft action plan for Climate & Ecological Emergency that is shared with members today and opening for public consultation.

In particular the heading "Doing Things Differently" with the introduction of a Citizens Assembly and the launch of a Decision Impact Assessment Tool to embed sustainability.

I would hope that the future Engagement Strategy will find a way to embrace community-led innovation and that commissioning, and procurement practice adapted to support the collaborative approach needed to deliver true local community wealth building through the lens of climate change and the UN sustainability goals more generally.

There were no petitions submitted for this meeting.

47. Record of Decisions of Cabinet and minutes of other Committees

The Committee Minutes for the last cycle of meetings were received.

Voting: Agreed

48. Recommendations arising from Cabinet and Other Committees

Cabinet 13 November 2019

The recommendations arising from the meeting of the Cabinet held on 13 November 2019 were then considered and approved:-

Minute No. 82 – BCP Corporate Parenting Strategy

The Portfolio Holder for Children and Families presented the report and proposed approval as set out on the agenda. She outlined the development of the Strategy.

Voting: Unanimous

Minute No. 84 – Quarter Two Budget Monitoring Report

The Portfolio Holder for Finance presented the report and proposed approval as set out on the agenda. He outlined the detail of the new capital project for the Environmental Innovation Hub at Durley Chine and the funding arrangements including the acceptance of Coastal Communities Grant Funding.

Voting: Unanimous

Minute No 86 – Adoption of Bournemouth, Christchurch, Poole and Dorset Waste Plan

The Portfolio Holder for Strategic Planning presented the report and proposed approval as set out on the agenda. She explained that this was a legacy issue and referred to the three sites in the BCP area detailed in the officers report.

Voting: Unanimous

Minute No 87 – Adoption of Bournemouth, Christchurch, Poole and Dorset Minerals Site Plan

The Portfolio Holder for Strategic Planning presented the report and proposed approval as set out on the agenda. She explained that this was another legacy issue and the Plan had been developed over the last five years. Councillors were advised of the sites in the BCP area at Roeshot, Christchurch and White's Pit, Poole.

Voting: Unanimous

49. Review of the Political Balance of the Council

The Chairman explained how he would deal with the recommendations in the report, a copy of which had been circulated to each Councillor and a copy of which appears as Appendix 'A' to these Minutes in the Minute Book.

The Chairman moved recommendation (a) which was an arithmetical calculation showing the revised overall political balance together with recommendation (b) which was an affirmation of the current number of

seats on each Committee. The Vice-Chairman seconded recommendations (a) and (b).

RESOLVED that:-

- (a) the revised political balance of the Council as set out in the report be agreed.**
- (b) the allocation of the total number of seats be considered and approved.**

The Chairman then asked for moves in respect of recommendations (c), (d) and (e).

Councillor Slade, Leader of the Council moved the following motion which was seconded by Councillor Mark Howell:

“That the three seats be allocated as follows:

Audit and Governance Committee – Liberal Democrats Group – Councillor Mike Brooke

Children’s Services Overview and Scrutiny Committee – Poole People and All Group

Licensing Committee – Conservative Group”

Councillor Philip Broadhead explained that the two unaligned Councillors should remain on the Committees that they were on prior to resigning as members of Poole People and All Group as they both wished to continue on these bodies and to seek a majority control on the Audit and Governance Committee was not in the spirit of the political balance of the Council. He moved the following amendment seconded by Councillor Judy Butt.

“Councillor Julie Bagwell remains on Licensing Committee

Councillor Daniel Butt remains on Audit and Governance Committee

Children’s Services Overview and Scrutiny Committee for the Liberal Democrats to consider a nomination”

Councillors commented on the implications of the proposals, including the chairmanship of the Audit and Governance Committee and the requirements of the political balance of the Council. Following debate upon being put to the vote the amendment detailed above was lost.

Voting: For – 36; Against – 36; Abstentions – 0

The Chairman used his casting vote and the amendment was lost.

The original motion was then put to the vote:

Voting: For – 36; Against – 36; Abstentions – 0

The Chairman used his casting vote and the motion was carried. It was therefore:

RESOLVED that the three seats be allocated as follows:

- Audit and Governance Committee – Liberal Democrats Group – Councillor Mike Brooke**
- Children’s Services Overview and Scrutiny Committee – Poole People and All Group**
- Licensing Committee – Conservative Group**

50. Response to Climate and Ecological Emergency

The Portfolio Holder for Environment and Climate Change presented a report, a copy of which had been circulated to each Councillor and a copy of which appears as Appendix 'B' to these Minutes in the Minute Book.

The report presented a draft action plan to meet the commitments of the Climate and Ecological Emergency Declaration made by Council on 16 July 2019 and the Corporate Strategy objective to 'tackle the climate change emergency'. The Portfolio Holder referred to the dedicated Council team, the public and all the departments across the Council acting on the climate emergency – including stopping fuel poverty, making the streets safer for children and being as ambitious as possible. Councillor Bull seconded the recommendations in the report. He thanked Officers for the work that had been undertaken acknowledging that there were many ways in which the action plan could be strengthened. Councillor Bull commented on the impact of the Air Show.

Councillors considered the action plan comments included the need to move as quickly as possible, whilst supporting the principle in the plan expressing concern about the dismissal of the Air Show and the proposals for a congestion charge, the need for the working group to do further work as it had only met once, the role of the Overview and Scrutiny Board, emphasising that the plan was a living document and how eagerly the public were looking forward to contributing to the plan, the potential impact of electric cars and the need for financial input from Central Government. A Councillor highlighted the number of proposals within the plan and encouraged Councillors to consider each initiative. A Councillor emphasised that BCP Council was showing the way in putting policies in place and offering an open door for investors. Councillors were informed of the quote from English Nature and the importance to protect the acid heathland.

A Councillor indicated that she was pleased to support this plan as her 6-year-old son was challenging her on what action was being taken. A Councillor explained why she had previously voted against the motion on the Climate and Ecological Emergency. She explained that she felt that the proposed action plan was too ambitious.

The Portfolio Holder in conclusion explained that the challenges were not underestimated, and the comments made were noted and would be raised with the Working Group.

RESOLVED that Council supports the following course of action:-

- (a) Endorses the draft Climate and Ecological Emergency Action Plan as the basis for a public consultation with a final report back to Council;**
- (b) To take the delivery of this Council's Climate and Ecological Emergency commitments into account in setting the Medium Term Financial Plan, with a view to additional financial support being added to the Climate Change Reserve (£120k) and Salix Fund (£120k);**

- (c) **Continues commitment to participate in the Global Covenant of Mayors for Climate and Energy, single-use plastic reduction initiatives and work towards a plastic-free Council; and**
- (d) **Development of a new overarching Environment Strategy, to include climate change adaptation, mitigation, ecology and all related issues.**

Voting: For – 71; Against – 0; Abstentions – 1

51. Calendar of Meetings 2020/21

The Chairman presented the draft Calendar of meetings for 2020/21, a copy of which had been circulated to each Councillor and a copy of which appears as Appendix 'C' to these Minutes in the Minute Book and moved its adoption.

A Councillors urged Committee Chairs to consider the timing of meetings and the implications for Councillors in travelling across the conurbation during the rush hour.

RESOLVED that the calendar of meetings for 2020/21 as circulated be agreed.

Voting: Unanimous

52. Notice of Motions in accordance with Procedure Rule 13

No motions had been submitted for this meeting.

53. Questions from Councillors

Question from Councillor Diana Butler

Visitors to Poole have commented on the poor state of the town and lack of public toilets.

Poole Quay is a major asset for the local economy: including tourism, business, fishing, boating, industry, events and recreation.

If we, as a Council, are striving to improve our communities and increase the viability of our towns – can I request that accessible public toilets are provided for Poole Quay?

Response by Councillor Mark Howell (Portfolio Holder for Regeneration and Culture)

Thank you for your question Cllr Butler.

A review of Public Toilets at Poole Quay was carried out and approved by the previous Poole Cabinet in February 2016. Following this review two council owned toilets were closed (Old Orchard and the Watch Station facilities). At this point a community toilet scheme was introduced with six toilets in the town centre area.

Along with other then opposition councillors in Poole, I opposed closure of the toilets. The toilets at Old Orchard were in poor condition due to anti-social activity, but I did not have confidence in the community toilet scheme.

We are committed to improving the offer for visitors to Poole Quay. Since the May elections, the Unity Alliance administration has refurbished and reopened the toilets at the watch station. Having visited the toilets this morning I can confirm these toilets are accessible, including a separate disabled toilet and a ramp up to it.

The privately owned toilets at Dolphin Quays remained open to the public during this period as part of an ongoing planning obligation for the development. There used to be public toilets on this site. When the building was constructed it was a planning obligation that it included toilets that would be available to the public 24 hours a day.

Following regular claims of vandalism the owners of the building (not the original owners) applied for a variation to this condition. During the tenure of the previous Poole administration, a decision was taken by the planning department AGAINST the advice of the environment officers to relax this condition and as a result the toilets are, more often than not, closed to the public. Attempting to reverse this decision would be costly and may not be successful.

Supplementary Question from Councillor Diana Butler

Councillor Butler asked where are the toilets which are open.

Response by Councillor Mark Howell (Portfolio Holder for Regeneration and Culture)

Councillor Howell reported that they were next to Poole Bridge.

Question from Councillor Karen Rampton

Residents in Bournemouth Poole and Christchurch who choose to subscribe to the Garden Waste Service will from 2020 be asked to pay £46 for one bin.

In Poole and Christchurch, residents will put their green waste into a 240 litre bin. Residents in Bournemouth will however pay the same amount for the use of a 140l bin.

Would the Portfolio Holder for Environment agree that the principle of providing equitable services and charges across the BCP conurbation is a necessary and fair course of action?

And would the Portfolio Holder agree that the charge for Bournemouth residents for the Green Waste service is inequitable and penalises them?

And what does the Portfolio Holder intend to do to rectify this injustice?

Response by Councillor Felicity Rice (Portfolio Holder for Environment and Climate Change)

In September 2019, BCP Council's Cabinet approved a paper that considered options for aligning the 2020 Garden Waste Collection Service to offer some parity to residents across BCP Council. This was discussed at overview and scrutiny as well. There are currently several service differences, not just the bin sizes, but also, service length for Christchurch residents and variations in service price, discounts and incentives offered. The amended paper recommended:

the alignment of the annual garden waste collection service price across BCP Council for the 2020 service at £46 per household for one bin

the pro-rotas of the Christchurch service collection fee for 2020 at £37.65 per household to reflect the service length from April to December 2020

the retention of the current multiple bin options: a) For Bournemouth residents at a rate of £60 for two 140l bins (280l) and £80 for three 140l bins (420l) b) For Christchurch & Poole residents at the full one bin price (£46 per extra 240l)

A bin replacement programme swapping Bournemouth's 140l for 240l would incur capital costs of £289,000, plus delivery cost. Consequently, as any major service change for 2020, such as changing bin sizes, may prove to be contradictory to the Government's direction, it was considered prudent by BCP's Cabinet to maintain the current bin sizes across BCP.

Officers will be exploring options to deliver greater parity of service as soon as possible, with a timescale that works alongside the Government's new waste strategy, outcomes of the consultations and associated legislation.

Supplementary Question from Councillor Karen Rampton

Councillor Rampton referred to the payment Bournemouth residents would pay from 2020 and asked about proportional payments for a couple of years until the review was undertaken.

Response by Councillor Felicity Rice (Portfolio Holder for Environment and Climate Change)

It is not possible to align everything across the conurbation all at once and we need to do this in steps. There are other services that are not aligned at present such as the food waste services for example.

The meeting ended at 8.30 pm

CHAIRMAN